

**GTZ Internal Project Review**

**Vocational Training and Employment Promotion  
in Tanzania**

PN 2000.2108.9

**VETA – GTZ – MoLYDS**

**Report**

On behalf of  
VETA-GTZ-MoLYDS Project  
Ewald Gold  
Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania

**gtz**

Dr. Horst Sommer      H. Günter Schröter

Addis Ababa / Harare, September 2001

## Table of contents

### Acronyms

1. Introduction	1
2. Summary of Findings and Recommendations	1
Findings	1
Recommendations	2
3. Assessment of Project Achievements	3
Project Planning	3
Project Implementat ion	5
Project Impact	7
4. Recommendations	7

### Annexes

1. Terms of Reference	Annex page 1
2. Interview Partners / Time schedule	Annex page 3
3. List of Documents	Annex page 5
4. Debriefing Form on Knowledge Management for GTZ Internal Review	Annex page 6
5. Erweiterung des Projektes in Richtung: <i>Ausbildung und Beschäftigung</i>	Annex page 8
6. DANIDA support	Annex page 11

## Acronyms

BDS	Business Development Service
BMZ	Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung
CBET	competency-based education and training
CDS	Curriculum Development Specialist
CSSC	Christian Social Services Commission
CTA	Chief Technical Advisor
CTI	Confederation of Tanzania Industries
Danida	Danish International Development Assistance
ESDP	Education Sector Development Programme
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ) GmbH (German Agency for Technical Co-operation), Eschborn
ILO	International Labour Organisation, Geneva
INTEP	Integrated Training For Entrepreneurship Promotion
MFI	Microfinance Institution
MoLYDS	Ministry of Labour, Youth Development and Sports
PFK	Projektfortschrittskontrolle
PPM	Project Planning Matrix
PS	Permanent Secretary
PVK	Projektverlaufskontrolle (= internal project progress review)
SAP	Strategic Action Plan (VETA SAPII: Second SAP from 2000-2004)
SIDA	Swedish International Development Agency
SIDO	Small Industry Development Organization
USAID	United State Agency for International Development
VET	Vocational Education and Training
VETA	Vocational Education and Training Authority
VSO	Voluntary Service Overseas

## 1. Introduction

A review team comprising of Dr. Horst Sommer (GTZ Ethiopia) and H. Günter Schröter (GTZ Zimbabwe) was requested by the VETA-GTZ project advisor Mr. E. Gold to conduct an internal project progress review (PVK) of the GTZ supported project "Promotion of Vocational Training" (PN 2000.2108.9) in Tanzania from August 20 to September 5, 2001.

The purpose of this review was to assess and document the project achievements of the current implementation phase and to determine priorities and to plan activities for the remaining time of the project until June 2002.

The review team assessed project activities and results with a particular focus on

- Documentation of key information of the progress made applying GTZ guidelines of knowledge management and
- Recommendations for activities up to the end of the project phase

A major focus was put on the Vocational Education and Training (VET) component of the project.

## 2. Summary of findings and recommendations

### Findings

The real start of the second project phase was delayed by about six months until that time when the commission by BMZ to GTZ was effected (12/2000). Between July and December 2000 the CTA and project partners had to struggle with the two decisions by BMZ, firstly to consolidate the activities and phase out the cooperation with VETA until middle of 2002 and secondly to establish a sound basis of cooperation with MOLYDS in the area of employment promotion. This was a diversion from the originally intended and communicated project proposal and up to now no official BMZ explanation has reached MOLYDS / VETA leaving frustration and demotivation behind. This was either sensed or articulated during various interviews the review team has held.

The now implemented project can only be seen as a skeleton of the once conceptualised long term System Reform Project. Although the project purpose and indicator remain the same it is questionable whether this can be achieved if the GTZ support to VETA comes to an end by 06/2002 because it remains doubtful whether DANIDA will carry on former GTZ activities.

The decision to keep the project title „Promotion of Vocational Training“ looks like a temporary arrangement because it does not reflect the new co-operation in the field of employment promotion with the second major partner MOLYDS. The review team gets the impression that the decision for terminating the project by middle of 2002 is already envisaged by BMZ since Vocational Training / Employment Promotion are no priority sectors of future German assistance to Tanzania and have to be phased out<sup>1</sup>. This needs to be discussed between the partners and finally decided upon during the upcoming bilateral consultations in November 2001.

Two major impacts on the "new VET System" can be observed:

---

<sup>1</sup> The Länderkonzept (Country Concept Paper) Tanzania, BMZ, 09/2000

- The VET policy currently under revision will aim at “creating conditions for the development of an entrepreneurial culture and its related skills in response to unexploited business opportunities, underemployment and unemployment particularly among the youth and women (rural and urban)”<sup>2</sup>
- The new VET System recognises the Informal Sector besides the Formal Sector.

Even when these major impacts to which the project has directly contributed they are still on a macro/policy level. The expected impact on the implementing level as defined by the indicator “at least 30% of the programme participants are employed or self-employed one year after completing the training” can not yet be verified and requires further mid-term assistance to VETA/MOLYDS. The assumption that DANIDA will incorporate present GTZ activities into their portfolio could not be verified by the review team. A clear position by DANIDA has to be in hand before the next bilateral meetings and needs full attention. The CTA should follow up the query with DANIDA (see annex 6).

### **Recommendations**

The recommended activities have to be seen and further discussed in the light of a “proper completion”<sup>3</sup> of projects or project components not fitting into the priority areas of co-operation as assured by BMZ.

The difficulty about the postulated proper completion is that the ongoing phase will come to an end only after half of the total project duration (5 instead 10 years) planned originally.

The main outcome of the project so far is to be seen in the efforts of integration of non-formal VET in the overall VET system. This significant outcome of the co-operation has to be consolidated.

Therefore all activities until the end of the ongoing project phase should be concentrated on the further development / consolidation and implementation of the extended INTEP concept in the sense that a feasible concept is available, pilot projects are run, and impact measurement instruments are developed and also tested. Therefore it is also required that enough (in terms of number) trained and committed staff from VETA and also from training providers are available.

It seems that the “skill training aspect” of INTEP training programmes/ projects is quite well developed and tested in first pilot projects. Even if the aspect of the employment orientation of this type of non-formal training programmes is considered in the concept already (different steps taken from CURRENT, e.g. analysing of goods, service and labour markets) additional instruments have to be added and implemented so that finally the target groups of INTEP projects have an increased chance in terms of the anticipated improved employment situation, employment creation<sup>4</sup> and income generation.

<sup>2</sup> Revised Vocational Education and Training Policy, Draft, August 2001

<sup>3</sup> See documents of bilateral consultations 1999/2000.

<sup>4</sup> So far the employment creation aspect (that means offering INTEP training for jobless target groups) is not a special/ a prominent aspect of the pilot projects already implemented.

**Therefore we recommend the following areas of activities to be completed until 06/2002:**

- I. Finalizing the (extended) INTEP-concept development and testing (further implementation)
- II. Knowledge transfer to VETA (and DANIDA<sup>5</sup>)/ capacity building
- III. Consolidation / embedding of employment oriented non-formal training provision for target groups of the informal sector in policy and strategies

The review team gets the impression that the decision for terminating the project by middle of 2002 is already envisaged by BMZ since Vocational Training / Employment Promotion are no priority sectors and have to be phased out<sup>6</sup>. This needs to be discussed between the partners and finally decided upon during the upcoming bilateral consultations in November 2001<sup>7</sup>.

### **3. Assessment of project achievements**

#### **Project planning**

The German contribution to the project "Promotion of Vocational Training" in Tanzania started with an orientation phase in 07/1997. In May 1999 a project progress review (PFK) was carried out and it was recommended to extend the orientation phase by 6 months, up to 06/2000. This extension allowed for coordinated planning among VETA, Danida and GTZ based on VETA's second 5-year plan, the SAPII. In 12/1999 VETA organized a workshop to discuss jointly the donor support related to the implementation of the SAPII. In a joint debriefing note (7.12.99) the VETA-GTZ Project envisaged to cooperate in the following areas in the next project phase 07/2000 – 06/2003 subject to approval by BMZ:

- Informal sector training strategies
- Entrepreneurship development
- Marketing policies and strategies and
- Capacity building

A lot of effort was invested by U. Borges (GTZ SIDO) and E. Gold in conceptualising the approach "Economic Development and Employment Promotion" for Tanzania. The concept was submitted to GTZ Regional Division to be considered during the next bilateral consultations (11/1999).

In October 1999 the MOLYDS through the MOF requested the BMZ for assistance in the areas of:

- Capacity building and strengthening of the department of employment and
- Implementing the new policy to create employment conducive conditions in Tanzania.

MOLYDS suggested that this support could be a joint programme together with the ongoing VETA-GTZ project since GTZ has already shown a commitment in the promotion of employment related training in Tanzania.

---

<sup>5</sup> A clear position by DANIDA has to be in hand before the next bilateral meetings and needs full attention. The CTA should follow up the query with DANIDA.

<sup>6</sup> If the process of phasing out is really envisaged than the postulated "Proper Completion" will be hard to achieve.

<sup>7</sup> "A schedule should be agreed with the partner for phasing out support to activities that are not incorporated in the focal areas." In: Recommendations regarding the concentration of activities in the context of selecting focal areas as part of BMZ country programming, BMZ, 11.Oktober 2000, p. 2

During the bilateral consultations in November 1999 it was recognised that the VETA-GTZ project has completed its orientation phase. The MOLYDS request was addressed in a way that it was suggested to extend the support to the private sector economy in general with a view to improve employment and income. It was further suggested that an appraisal mission has to be conducted.

Because it was felt that the consultations left room for interpretation the VETA-GTZ advisor was looking for clarification and the way forward therefore entered a dialogue with GTZ Regional Division.

In Feb/March 2000 a project development assessment was carried out aiming to identify possibilities of cooperation with MOLYDS within the employment policy framework in Tanzania. During this mission a first concept of a Project in Employment Promotion (PEP) was developed with the objective: Employment promotion strategies developed and initiated and supported by selected labour market interventions. One observation of the consultant during this mission left the impression that VETA regarded the new project with suspicion since future resources provided by the German Government would have to be shared between VETA and MOLYDS. It became obvious that more conceptual and organisational matters need to be clarified before launching PEP. Therefore the consultant recommended a second mission before the start of the next phase (July 2000).

On the basis of the Joint Debriefing Note and the first concept of PEP the VETA-GTZ Advisor together with his partners drafted the offer (05-06/2000) for the next phase (07/2000 – 06/2003). The now revised project is called "Employment and Vocational Education and Training" and the purpose: unemployed people benefit more from effective VET programmes and from a more conducive employment environment. Six outputs were defined out of which two new outputs addressed the support to MOLYDS. The other outputs were aiming at further applying employment related training programmes with a focus on the informal sector and at linkages among major stakeholders in employment promotion, labour market and VET.

Between submission of the offer (06/2000) and October 2000 the following important decision by BMZ took place:

1) The Country Concept Paper Tanzania (BMZ, 09/2000) refers to the consultations stating that following priority sectors were defined: Water, Health and Natural Resources. Projects of other sectors, incl. education and training have to be phased out<sup>8</sup>.

- 1) BMZ considers policy assistance on employment promotion as a cross cutting issue and
- 2) A new project phase up to June 2002 will have two major objectives:
  - Consolidation of activities and phasing out cooperation with VETA and
  - Establishing a sound basis of cooperation with MOLYDS in the area of employment promotion

This decision curtailed the intended and agreed upon project and it was communicated to MOLYDS (via the VETA-GTZ advisor) leading to confusion what is reflected in the letter to BMZ (29.11.2000). Up to now there was no official response by BMZ. In January 2001 the Director of the GTZ office in Dar Es Salaam explained the situation to the P.S. of MOLYDS and referred to the coming bilateral consultations which were supposed to be held in April but were then postponed to November 2001.

---

<sup>8</sup> Instead of the foreseen priority " Structural and Regulatory Policy (Struktur- und ordnungspolitische Beratung)" the priority area "Natural Resources" was selected.

The offer has been revised with little support from the partners and submitted again to BMZ and the commission to GTZ came in December 2000. The now implemented project can only be seen as a skeleton of the once conceptualised long term System Reform Project. Although the project purpose and indicator remain the same it is questionable whether this can be achieved if the GTZ support to VETA comes to an end by 06/2002 because it remains doubtful whether DANIDA will carry on former GTZ activities. The cooperation between GTZ and MOLYDS beyond 06/2002 also needs to be reassured.

## **Project implementation**

Project activities related to output 1: Functions of the MOLYDS regarding labour market policy are clarified and activities implemented.

Activities were focused on the process to up grade the Employment Division into an Employment Department. A paper describing the roles and functions of the envisaged department incl. job descriptions for key positions has been discussed and agreed upon by MOLYDS and the Civil Service Commission. It is expected that soon MOLYDS submits the paper to the Cabinet for endorsement.

A strategic workshop on Employment Promotion with stakeholders was conducted (29. – 30.8.2001) with the aim to clarify further the employment policy and employment promotion strategy of MOLYDS and to identify possible core activities for a GTZ support. This activity can be seen as a follow up of the appraisal mission from 02-03/2000. Commitments of stakeholders (MOLYDS, VETA, others) are very critical now and have to be formulated and communicated to BMZ/GTZ applying proper communication channel before the next bilateral consultations (11/2001).

Project activities related to output 2: Concept for support of employment training programmes are applied and marketed (VETA)

GTZ supported various INTEP pilot programmes in 7 regions. An assessment took place in Sep 2000 to enable reviewing of the concept for further adaptation (report available, Binamungu/Adam, Nov 2000). The assessment report reveals that the process concentrated on the concept development and capacity building, however the programme aims/goals have not been assessed fully in relation to income generation or employment creation as anticipated. Therefore the consultants suggest further measures e.g. business advice (BDS), access to markets, access to credit (MFIs) and to further built and consolidate the cooperation with institutions and organisations providing such services. After that recommendation the INTEP concept has been further developed and complemented but the now extended concept has not been tested yet (presentation for IVETA conference Jamaica 2001 and INTEP concept paper, February 2001).

The review team recommends further application, monitoring and impact assessment of the extended INTEP concept in few selected regions.

The intended knowledge transfer from GTZ to Danida on INTEP depends on resources (personnel and finances) provided by Danida. The replication by Danida depends also on conditions VETA has to meet before the third Danida project phase will commence in 2003 (see annex 6).

The project supported training of more than 60 facilitators/coordinators in 4 workshops. But the review team was not able to assess performance of facilitators/coordinators. From interviews with Dir VET and CDS of VETA further training of INTEP coordinators is required



in: needs assessment, project planning, impact monitoring and evaluation and financial management, stakeholder networking.

VETA management decided to apply the CBET approach within the INTEP concept. A presentation guide for instructional techniques course in CBET is being developed by VETA with assistance by Danida. Units/tasks form the basis for employment oriented non-formal short training courses. INTEP consultant S. Adam will follow up on this activity in 09/2001.

Project activities related to Output 3: Linkages between stakeholders in employment promotion, labour market and VET established (VETA and MOLYDS)

Regular information exchange not yet established. Informal linkages/networking takes place mainly during workshops. The support related to labour market information is being covered by US Department of Labour and ILO.

GTZ supported:

- development of documentation on training and employment
- publication "Catalogue for VET Provider"
- procurement of 1600 books/guidelines/curricula etc. for VETA.

The production of a CD-ROM "Documentation on Training and Employment" is under preparation.

Dir VET VETA participated in the UNESCO/SADC workshop in Botswana (12/2000). Follow-up meetings on specific projects related to INTEP and Access/Equity took place (ongoing). DG and Dir VET VETA participated at IVETA conference (Jamaica, 08/2001) where they presented the INTEP concept.

The 3<sup>rd</sup> regional IVETA conference (Tanzania, 11/2001) is being prepared as well as participation and inputs to workshops/conferences on non-formal training and employment promotion (Erbismühle and Bad Boll, 9/2001).

#### Other project activities

The CTA had frequent management meetings together with consultants on the new VET policy and provided inputs related to amendments of the VET act (discussions/workshops/comments).

Very time consuming interventions which fitted well during the first half of 2001 were related to the task force for "Vocational and Folk Education and Training" (task force activities are on behalf of the Inter-ministerial Steering Committee within the ESDP and inputs have been discussions/meetings and organisation /moderation of a workshop). A draft strategy paper has been developed and forwarded to P. S. MOLYDS. If further support is requested by the task force additional assistance by consultants and a moderator is required.

The CTA assisted a VETA/Danida initiative in planning a training course for VETA instructors and managers related to Sexual and Reproductive Health / HIV / AIDS. For this purpose an additional GTZ input has been organised and info-material distributed.

#### Other activities

Meetings/discussions/contribution to papers related to advisory services to CSSC in Education and Training as well as meetings every 2<sup>nd</sup> week (incl. correspondence) related to the education sector donor committee in preparing and planning of the ESDP.

### **Project impact<sup>9</sup>**

Two major impacts on the “new VET System” can be observed:

- The VET policy currently under revision will aim at “creating conditions for the development of an entrepreneurial culture and its related skills in response to unexploited business opportunities, underemployment and unemployment particularly among the youth and women (rural and urban)”
- The new VET System recognises the Informal Sector besides the Formal Sector.

Those two impacts can be linked to direct project interventions with VETA or the many complementary interventions by the CTA through Task Force and Committee work (e.g. ESDP).

Employment promotion has been recognised as a key factor in poverty alleviation and the compensation of social hardships.<sup>10</sup> MOLYDS is aware of its key role in co-ordinating and mainstreaming nation-wide activities and is ready to give guidance and take the lead in combating unemployment and poverty. However tangible impacts depend now on how soon the employment unit under MOLYDS can be upgraded into a department and how fast job vacancies there can be filled and staff developed.

The expected impact on project purpose level as defined by the indicator (“at least 30% of the programme participants are employed or self-employed one year after completing the training”) can not yet be verified. Since implementation of the current project phase (07/2000) impact monitoring is still at an infancy stage. It is therefore recommended to concentrate on the further application, monitoring and impact assessment of the extended INTEP concept in few selected regions in order to at least verify the concept and its intended employment promotion on a sample basis.

## **4. Recommendations for Activities up to the end of the Project Phase**

The project in the ongoing phase (07/00 to 06/02) consists of two components:

- a) VETA support concerning non-formal training (since 07/97) and
- b) MoLYDS support concerning employment promotion (since 07/00).

**The defined purpose of this mission concentrates on the VETA component only (assisting in policy- und organisational promotion of vocational education and training, on the technical level mainly focusing on the introduction of employment oriented non-formal training for target groups from the informal sector as a new main pillar of the training system).**

On the other hand it may be asserted, however, that both components have to be seen more in their inter-linkage than as parallel components.<sup>11</sup>

---

<sup>9</sup> The review team’s understanding of impact monitoring relates to the „Guidelines for impact monitoring in economic and employment promotion projects with special reference to poverty reduction impacts“, part I and part II, M. Valhaus, T. Kuby, GTZ Section 41

<sup>10</sup> Vocational Education and Training and Employment Promotion Project, GTZ-MOLYDS-VETA, Mission Report, Dr. F. Wiessner, 09/2001

<sup>11</sup> Activities related to development and implementation of employment promotion policies and strategies (cooperation area with the Ministry of Labor) and provision of employment oriented non-formal training for different target groups

Based on the project planning documents, the assessment of project implementation and achievements, but also (if not mainly) the implications given through the concentration on priority areas in the bilateral development co-operation we would like emphasize the urgent need to concentrate the activities up to the end of the project phase on the issues which are outlined below.

The recommended activities have to be seen and further discussed in the light of a “proper completion” of projects or project components not fitting into the priority areas of co-operation.

The difficulty about the postulated proper completion is that the project is proposed by BMZ to come to an end only after half of the total project duration (5 instead 10 years) planned originally.

The main outcome of the project is to be seen in the efforts of integration of non-formal VET in the overall VET system. This significant co-operation outcome has to be consolidated.

Therefore all activities should be concentrated on the further development/ consolidation and implementation of the extended INTEP concept in the sense that a feasible concept is available, pilot projects are run, and impact measurement instruments are developed and also tested. Therefore it is also required that enough (in terms of number) trained and committed staff from VETA and also from training providers are available.

It seems that the “skill training aspect” of INTEP training programmes/ projects is quite well developed and tested in first pilot projects. Even if the aspect of the employment orientation of this type of non-formal training programmes is considered in the concept already (different steps taken from CURRENT, e.g. analyse of goods, service and labour markets) additional instruments have to be added and implemented so that finally the target groups of INTEP projects have an increased chance in terms of the anticipated improved employment situation, employment creation and income generation.

**Therefore we recommend the following areas of activities to be completed until 06/2002:**

- I. Finalizing the (extended) INTEP-concept development and testing (further implementation)
- II. Knowledge transfer to VETA (and DANIDA)/ capacity building
- III. Consolidation/ embedding of employment oriented non-formal training provision for target groups of the informal sector in policy and strategies

More details regarding these areas of activities are outlined below:

**I. Finalizing the (extended) INTEP-concept development and testing (further implementation):**

1. Further complement the INTEP-concept in terms of<sup>12</sup>
  - Entrepreneurial training elements
  - Business advise (BDS)
  - Access to credits (MFIs)
  - Support measures to market access

---

<sup>12</sup> Most of this additional instruments are already mentioned in the concept. See B. Ndunguru: VETA-Tanzania: Integrated Training Promotion for Entrepreneurship. IVETA, Aug 2001. But they are not yet operationalised and tested. Therefore the main emphasis has to be stressed on operationalising and implementing.

2. Test the extended concept, concentrate on max 2 to 3 VETA zones, by including also other target groups than mainly already self-employed from the informal sector,
3. Monitor the test runs and measure the impact in terms of employment creation and income generation of the pilot projects
4. Document lessons learnt / best practices
5. Develop and provide a comprehensive "INTEP Tool Kit" to VETA at national and zonal level as kind of implementation guideline and as basis for TOT

## **II. Knowledge transfer to VETA / capacity building**

1. Advise VETA at national and regional level to provide qualified staffs to facilitate the INTEP implementation
2. Support capacity building, involve VETA staff permanently in further concept development and implementation activities, train VETA staff (in charge of INTEP implementation and further concept development for the next years) also through stronger involvement (number of staff involved) in all activities mentioned under I. above
3. Further follow up willingness and preparedness of DANIDA to support the implementation of employment oriented non-formal training programmes for target groups from the informal sector as well as continue and strengthen the cooperation with DANIDA in concept development and implementation activities of INTEP
4. Develop an action plan for INTEP implementation (including impact assessment measures and further concept adaptation/ development) for the next 3 to 4 years that VETA has to implement INTEP without GTZ and without DANIDA-support

## **III. Consolidation/ embedding of employment oriented non-formal training provision for target groups of the informal sector in policy and strategies**

1. Link to employment promotion policy/ strategy
2. Initiate cooperation between VETA and the employment department to be created and local authorities (also under the aspect of "INTEP concept marketing") from the very beginning
3. Initiate first steps to bring VETA in a position to act as implementer of employment promotion programmes
4. support VETA to act as an important intermediary for the implementation of and active labour market policy<sup>13</sup>.

---

<sup>13</sup> Following the proposal of the (draft) mission report "Vocational Education and Training and Employment Promotion Project" by F. Wießner, Sept. 2001, page 4

## **Annexes**

### **1. Terms of Reference**

#### **Internal Project Progress Review**

#### **Project on Vocational Training and Employment Promotion in Tanzania**

##### Introduction

In 1997 the Project on Vocational Education and Training commenced with policy advice and technical advice to the Vocational Education and Training Authority (VETA) concerning non-formal training on the national level and the regional level in Dar es Salaam. The project plan for the orientation phase (07/1997 – 06/2000) was flexible enough to allow the assistance to respond to the actual requirements.

At the end of the first project phase the assistance to the Dar es Salaam Region came to an end and during the second project phase (07/2000 – 06/2002) the regional and national assistance was offered from the VETA Head Office. In addition the Project offered beginning with this phase advice to the Ministry of Labour, Youth Development and Sports (MoLYDS) concerning Employment Promotion.

The purpose of this part of the Project Review is to assess and document the Project achievements so far assisting in promotion of Vocational Education and Training and to determine priorities and to plan activities for the remaining time of the project phase. A second part of the Project Review will later concentrate on the assistance in Employment Promotion.

##### **Activities**

The consultants are expected to:

1. read the relevant project documents
2. assess the activities and results and
3. document key information of the progress made according to guidelines of GTZ knowledge management concept
4. give recommendations for activities up to the end of the project phase and consolidate with the project coordinator and project partners

##### **Results**

The consultants will submit:

- One report reflecting the project information according to activity 3. above, (responsible: Hans-Guenter Schroeter)
- One report containing a consolidated project activity plan according to the activity 4. above, (responsible: Dr. Horst Sommer)

Ewald Gold, Dar es Salaam, 26<sup>th</sup> July, 2001



**2. Interviewpartner / Time schedule**

ITINERARY – Dr. Horst Sommer and Mr. Guenter Schroeter,

Subject: Documentation of the project's results, achievements and planning activities for the remaining period of the project phase

**From 24<sup>th</sup> Aug. to 4<sup>th</sup> Sept. 2001**

DATE	ACTIVITY	REMARKS
Friday 24 <sup>th</sup> Aug. 2001	8:30am – Meet Mr. D. Mey	Venue: GTZ Office Contact: 2115901
Tuesday 28 <sup>th</sup> Aug. 2001	9:30am - Meet Director General, Dr. A. Meru  2:00pm- Meet Senior Adviser Danida, Mrs. Ulla Müller	Venue: VETA Head Office Contact: 2863409; E-mail: <a href="mailto:veta@raha.com">veta@raha.com</a>  Venue: VETA Danida Office Contact: 0741 332538; E-mail: <a href="mailto:umtz@tyc-tz.com">umtz@tyc-tz.com</a>
Wednesday 29 <sup>th</sup> Aug. 2001	9:00am - Meet Learning Evaluation Specialist, Mr. G. Sabuni  11:00am - Meet Curriculum Developer Specialist, Mrs. R. Binamungu	Venue: VETA Head Office Contact: 0744 290685 E-mail: <a href="mailto:ggsabuni@hotmail.com">ggsabuni@hotmail.com</a>  Venue: VETA Head Office Contact: 0744 289952; <a href="mailto:nyayona@hotmail.com">nyayona@hotmail.com</a>
Thursday 30 <sup>th</sup> Aug. 2001	8:30am-Meet Training Systems Development Advisor, Mr Carsten Hüttemeier  1:00pm- Meet Regional Director, Mr. P. Mateso (for an hour)  3:00pm-Meet Permanent Secretary, MoLYDS, Mrs. Rose Lugembe	Venue: VETA Danida Office  Venue: VETA Regional Office Contact: 2862651  Venue: PS Office Contact: 2110877
Friday 31 <sup>st</sup> Aug 2001	8:30am- Meet Ex. Vet board member & Councillor for CTI, Dr. S. Nyantahe	Venue: Daima Associates Ltd Contact:
Monday 3 <sup>rd</sup> Sept 2001	9:00am-Meet Ag. Asst. Labour Commissioner  11:00am-Meet Meet VETA Director of Vocational Education and Training, Mrs. B. Ndunguru	Venue:  Venue: VETA Head Office Contact: 2863409; E-mail: <a href="mailto:veta@raha.com">veta@raha.com</a>

### 3. List of documents

1. Terms of Reference Progress Review 08/01
2. Datenblatt für Wissensmanagement / Debriefing im Rahmen PFK
3. Datenblatt für das Wissensmanagement / Debriefing im Rahmen PVK
4. Project Planning Matrix (PPM) 05/98
5. Joint Debriefing Notes 10.12.1999
6. Project Planning Matrix (PPM) 01/01
7. Angebotsentwurf, Juni 2000
8. PPM 06.2000
9. Änderungsangebot für zweite Phase 16.11.00
10. Status
11. Report VETA GTZ Project July 2000
12. Fortschrittsbericht 4, 07/2001
13. Report Adam, September 1998, Focus on the Informal Sector,
14. Report Adam, February 2001, Concepts and Methods
15. Report Moll, November 1999
16. Report Moll, Februar 2000
17. Report Moll, April 2000
18. Axmann Report, Proposal: Project on Employment Promotion, 04/2000
19. Specht Report, Promotion of demand-oriented Vocational Training Dar es Salaam, 08/2000
20. Pfander/Gold, Concepts and Approaches to VET in the Informal Sector, 01/2000
21. Bernadetta Ndunguru, I N T E P, Reaching the Target Groups in the Informal Sector and Micro and Small Enterprises
22. VET ACT 1994
23. VETA SAP II
24. VETA Organisational Chart
25. VETA Draft Policy August 2001
26. Project Activity Plan 2001
27. Briefentwurf PS an BMZ, Request for employment promotion assistance, Sept. 1999
28. Letter to PS 16th August 2001, Technical Cooperation between MoLYDS and GTZ
29. Memorandum on Cooperation, 16.08.2001 (Annex to Letter to PS)
30. Memorandum to PS 28.09.2000
31. Letter from MoLYDS to BMZ 29.11.2000
32. Schreiben von Detmering am 27.07.01
33. Briefentwurf an BMZ von E. Gold, 11. Juli 2001
34. Briefentwurf an BMZ von Zentrale, 24. Juli 2001
35. Forms for INTEP
36. Workshop Outline Employment, August 2001
37. Laenderkonzept Tanzania, BMZ, September 2000



#### 4. Debriefing Form on Knowledge Management for GTZ Internal Review

Datenblatt für das Wissensmanagement / Debriefing im Rahmen PVK

<b>Projektname:</b> Förderung der beruflichen Ausbildung <b>Projektnummer:</b> 2000.2108.9 <b>AV/ AP:</b> Ewald Gold <b>AMA:</b> keine		
<b>Land:</b>  Tanzania		
<b>Counterpartinstitution:</b> Ministry of Labour, Youth Development and Sports (MOLYDS) und Vocational Education and Training Authority (VETA)		<b>Ebene der Beratung:</b>  Makro- und Mesoebene
<b>Projektbeginn:</b> Juli 1997	<b>Projektende:</b> Juni 2007	<b>Aktuelle Phase:</b> Juli 2000 – Juni 2002
<b>GTZ- Arbeitsfeld:</b> OE 4115 (Berufliche Bildung)		<b>AP in PuE</b> U. Krammschneider
<b>Erstellt von:</b> Dr. Horst Sommer und H. Günter Schröter		<b>Anlass, Datum:</b> PVK, 5.9.2001
<b>Kurzbeschreibung des Vorhabens:</b>  <p>Ein Kernproblem in Tanzania sind die hohe und weiter steigende Arbeitslosigkeit und Unterbeschäftigung Jugendlicher und vor allem weiblicher Jugendlicher sowie Frauen. Mit dem Projektziel: Arbeitslose profitieren von effektiveren Ausbildungsprogrammen und von verbesserten Bedingungen für Beschäftigung soll diesem Problem begegnet werden.</p> <p>Die Hauptinterventionen zielen auf eine Beratung des MOLYDS im Bereich Beschäftigungsförderung sowie auf eine Beratung von VETA im Bereich non-formaler Ausbildung für Zielgruppen im informellen Sektor.</p>		
<b>Spezielle Tätigkeit im Rahmen des Programms: (Hauptwirkungen durch eigene Beratertätigkeit etc.)</b>  <p>Partner (VETA) implementiert neue Berufsbildungspolitik, die neben dem bisher dominierenden formalen Subsektor non-formale Berufsbildung für Zielgruppen aus dem informellen Sektor stark berücksichtigt (integriertes Berufsbildungssystem).</p> <p>Beschäftigungsförderung hat höheren politischen Stellenwert erfahren und Partner arbeitet konzentriert an Konzeptionen und Strategien zur Umsetzung.</p>		
<b>Vorliegende Erfahrungen, die für GTZ und andere Projekte relevant und nützlich sein können:</b>  <p>Die im Prozess der Schwerpunktsetzung (BMZ/GTZ) angedachte Halbierung der geplanten Projektlaufzeit hat nicht nur Irritationen beim Partner (MOLYDS, VETA) verursacht, sondern auch die Erreichung des Projektziels in Frage gestellt.</p>		

**Durch das Projekt entwickelte oder angewandte Arbeitsinstrumente: (Auswahl der relevanten Instrumente, z.B. spezielle Monitoringsysteme, Software, Guidelines, Handreichungen, Manuale...etc.):**

Befinden sich noch in der Entwicklungs-/Erprobungsphase

**Vorliegende Studien, Berichte und andere Produkte (Auswahl von relevanten Dokumente und Produkten):**

Hauptprodukt: Konzept für "Integrated Training for Entrepreneurship Promotion" (INTEP)

**Für GTZ oder andere Projekte potentiell interessante Wissensträger:**

B. Ndunguru, Dir VET, VETA  
R. Binamungu, Curriculum Development Specialist, VETA  
Dr. S. Adam, INTEP Gutachter  
E. Gold, CTA, VETA-GTZ Projekt

**Lessons learnt: (Welche Lernerfahrungen sind aus dem Projekt abzuleiten, die insbesondere auch zur Vermeidung von Fehlern in anderen Projekten beitragen können)**

1. Es ist sehr wichtig, dass gut funktionierende Kommunikationsstrukturen zwischen Projekt, GTZ Büro, Dt. Botschaft (EZ Ref.), GTZ Zentrale (RG, PuE) und BMZ bestehen. Insbesondere in Zeiten, wenn es um Konzeptänderungen/-anpassungen eines Projekts geht. Zur Pflege von guten Partnerschaftsbeziehungen sollte man nicht ausschließlich und vordergründig Wert auf formalisierte Kommunikationswege legen.
2. Gute Kooperationsmechanismen mit anderen Gebern aus dem gleichen Sektor (hier insbesondere Danida, GTZ).
3. Systemberatungsprojekte, von denen gleichzeitig Wirkungen bei den unmittelbaren Zielgruppen angestrebt werden, sind nicht nur langfristig zu planen sondern auch umzusetzen.

**Best practices: (Welche besonderen Produkte, Erfahrungen, Methoden oder andere Errungenschaften des Projektes können zur Nachahmung empfohlen werden)**

De-briefing notes (gemeinsame Abstimmung zwischen Partner und verschiedenen Gebern) in bezug auf Policies, Strategien und Operations-/Arbeitspläne

Lange Planungsphase wurde zur Vertrauensbildung genutzt und überzeugte die Partner, die Trainingsangebote zu diversifizieren (Dauer, integriertes Konzept) und auf weitere, sozial benachteiligte Zielgruppen auszuweiten.

## 5. Erweiterung des Projektes in Richtung: *Ausbildung und Beschäftigung*

Folgende Punkte kennzeichnen den gegenwärtigen Zeitpunkt (05/2000) der Projektplanung:

1. Der Schwerpunkt der Förderung von VETA durch die GTZ in der ersten und zweiten Projektphase liegt in der Entwicklung von Methoden, *mit Hilfe beschäftigungsorientierter, zielgruppenspezifischer Unterstützung die Chancen für eine Beschäftigung für neue und benachteiligte Zielgruppen zu vergrößern*. Die Entwicklung des Konzepts ist fortgeschritten und wird zur Zeit in verschiedenen Pilotmaßnahmen erprobt. Die Förderung für diese armen Zielgruppen wird immer zu einem gewissen Grad bezuschusst werden müssen, aber die Einnahmen aus der VET-Levy sind für größere Programme zu niedrig.<sup>14</sup> Das Konzept kann sich jedoch nur voll entfalten, wenn einerseits finanzielle Mittel für die breitere Umsetzung bereitgestellt werden. Andererseits nimmt die erwartete Wirkung, also die Beschäftigung der Zielgruppen, zu, wenn die Rahmenbedingungen für Existenzgründungen und für die abhängige Beschäftigung staatlicherseits verbessert, zumindest aber die Hindernisse abgebaut werden.
2. Der Schwerpunkt des Projektes weiterhin bleibt erhalten und VETA bleibt nach den Gesprächen zwischen VETA und MoLYD auch in der nächsten Phase der Hauptpartner. Die Wirkungen sollen künftig aber dadurch erhöht werden, daß sowohl auf der Implementierungsebene (VETA) die Voraussetzungen für effektive Planung und Ausführung von Programmen geschaffen werden, als auch Beschäftigungsförderung insgesamt eine höhere entwicklungspolitische Priorität erhält (MoLYD). Neben der Unterstützung auf der Durchführungsebene soll deswegen auch die zuständige MoLYD-Abteilung dabei gefördert werden, den politischen Willen zu stärken, die relevanten Arbeitsverordnungen und -gesetze zu verbessern und künftig Mittel für Beschäftigungsförderung (aus dem Staatshaushalt und von Gebern) kompetenter akquirieren zu können. Die Durchführung der Maßnahmen würden weiterhin Träger wie VETA, SIDO, etc. übernehmen.
3. Das Projekt ist mitten in einem (ungleichen) Planungsprozess. VETA auf der einen Seite hat in einer längeren Planung im vergangenen Jahr einen zweiten 5jährigen Strategieplan (SAP II) entwickelt und weiß ziemlich genau, welche Aufgaben sie angehen will. VETA bat die GTZ ausdrücklich um weitere Unterstützung im unter 1. beschriebenen Projektschwerpunkt. Danida und VSO übernehmen andere Aufgaben. Das Arbeitsministerium (MoLYD) auf der anderen Seite ist jedoch in einem desolaten Zustand. Allerdings gibt es ein neues Gesetz zur Beschäftigungsförderung und den politischen Willen, es umzusetzen, es gibt eine neue engagierte Abteilungsleiterin und die Bereitschaft, einige der offenen Posten in dieser Abteilung zu besetzen. Mit der Operationsplanung steht man noch ganz am Anfang, die Initialzündung dazu gab unser Gutachter. Es liegen zwar Ideen und erste Konzepte vor, aber noch kein allseits abgestimmter Plan. Es braucht Zeit, bis diese MoLYD-Abteilung ihre Aufgaben und Prioritäten geklärt hat. Auch bis das MoLYD seine und die neuen Funktionen der künftigen dezentralen Strukturen definiert, sowie einen Weg der Zusammenarbeit mit den anderen Beteiligten (privater Sektor und andere Ministerien) gefunden hat. Die GTZ wurde gebeten, das Arbeitsministerium bei diesem Prozess zu begleiten.
4. Es ist nicht einfach, bei dieser unterschiedlichen Ausgangssituation und Unsicherheit der weiteren Entwicklung ein konsistentes gemeinsames Angebot und PPU (unter Zeitdruck) zu verfassen. Die VETA-Komponente für sich genommen ist ziemlich eindeutig und klar. Zu Vieles ist jedoch noch nicht geklärt im MoLYD, aber auch in der Zusammenarbeit beider Partner und anderer Beteiligter und in Bezug auf unseren

---

<sup>14</sup> Außerdem stellt sich die Frage der Legitimität der Verwendung einer von Arbeitgebern erhobenen zweckgebundenen Gebühr für soziale Zwecke, die eigentlich aus allgemeinen Steuermitteln zu bestreiten wären.

möglichen Beitrag. Wir müssen eine Balance in der Darstellung finden, mit einem noch vorläufigen Konzept, das sowohl klare Aufgaben enthält (VETA) als auch weitere Klärungsschritte (MoLYD) zu Beginn der nächsten Phase. Nach einer Klärungsphase wird eventuell ein Änderungsangebot nötig sein.

5. Wir sind uns darüber im Klaren, dass eine noch größere Beschäftigungswirkung von einer Wirtschaftsentwicklung in Tansania (selbständig oder gezielt gefördert) ausgehen würde. Beide Förderkonzepte würden deshalb im Verbund am besten wirken. Die deutsche Seite hat sich bei den Konsultationen im November 1999 jedoch dafür entschieden, den Bereich der Beschäftigungsförderung zu unterstützen.
6. Zusammenfassend: Der Zweck der Zusammenarbeit mit dem Arbeitsministerium ist die Erhöhung der Beschäftigungswirkung (mindestens) für die Zielgruppen, die an beschäftigungsfördernden Maßnahmen der VETA teilgenommen haben.

## **Ewald Gold**

### **Planung der zweiten Projektphase**

#### **1999**

April	PFK durch Uwe Sander, Marianne Reuber, David Manyanza
Sept. – November	Entwicklung des 2. VETA Strategic Action Plan (SAP II, 2000 – 2004) mit Beteiligung von Danida und GTZ
August – Oktober	Entwurf eines GTZ-Wirtschafts- und Beschäftigungsförderungskonzeptes (WBF) in Tansania (Uta Borges, Ewald Gold), Weiterleitung des Konzeptes über BÜL an RL zur Vorbereitung der Konsultationen
Oktober	Schreiben des tansanischen Arbeitsministeriums (MoLYD) an BMZ: Bitte um Prüfung von Ansätzen der Beschäftigungsförderung in Tansania und um fachliche Unterstützung des MoLYD durch GTZ
November	Konsultationen: Weiterführung der Kooperation mit VETA und BMZ-Zusage für Unterstützung des MoLYD nach vorheriger Prüfung, gleichzeitig Kürzung der Mittel von 4,5 auf 3,8 Mio DM für die nächste Phase. Der Teil Wirtschaftsförderung des WBF-Konzeptes wurde vom BMZ abgelehnt.
Dezember	Abstimmungskonferenz zwischen VETA und GTZ, Danida, VSO auf der Basis des SAP II. Vereinbarung mit GTZ, nach der Qualifizierung des Personals die direkte Förderung der Regionaldirektion Dar es Salaam zu beenden (wie auch SIDA und Danida diese direkte Förderung beendet haben) und die Arbeiten auf nationaler Ebene in den bisherigen Schwerpunktbereichen fortzusetzen: <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• beschäftigungsorientierte Aus- und Fortbildung für spezielle Zielgruppen</li><li>• Einführung in kaufmännisches und unternehmerisches Handeln integriert in der technischen Ausbildung</li><li>• Marketing von Dienstleistungen von VETA (neuer Bereich)</li><li>• Fortbildung des VETA-Personals in den drei Bereichen</li></ul>
Dezember	Mitteilung (EG) an BÜL, an RL und Claudia Gomm mit Interpretation des in diesem Projekt nicht eindeutigen Protokolls der Konsultationen und Beschreibung des weiteren geplanten Vorgehens

## GTZ Internal Project Review: Vocational Training and Employment Promotion in Tanzania

### 2000

Januar	Gespräche mit RL und Claudia Gomm über weitere Planung
Januar – Februar	Einsatzplanung für Gutachter Michael Axmann
März	Einsatz Gutachter Michael Axmann
April	Diskussion des Prüfberichtes mit VETA und MoLYD, erste HALFA-Sitzung Gespräche zwischen MoLYD und VETA mit dem Ergebnis: VETA soll Haupt- Projektpartner bleiben, gemeinsamer Planungsworkshop geplant und wieder verschoben
11./12. Mai	neuer Termin für Planungsworkshop

### weitere Planung:

bis 20. Mai	HALFA-Sitzung
31. Mai	Abgabe Angebotsentwurf an BÜL

**Danida support**

From: "Jensen, Mogens" <mojens@um.dk>  
To: Hans-Guenter Schroeter <guenterschroeter@operamail.com>  
Cc: "Karlsen, Ketil Iversen (t)" <T-KETKAR@um.dk>  
**Subject: SV: GTZ / DANIDA support to VETA Tanzania**  
Date: Sat, 8 Sep 2001 16:55:47 +0200 Sensitivity: Personal

Dear Mr Schroeter,

Thank you very much for your mail. I sincerely regret the decision by the GTZ to withdraw its support to VETA, although I can easily follow and understand the argumentation for change of focus in Tanzania.

In general, Danish support to VETA is outlined in a programme document, which has been approved by the Danish authorities. The programme document outlines the activities agreed between the parties for a given period of time and they are reviewed annually. It is hardly possible to increase the financial support to VETA with a short notice.

In my position, I act as an adviser only and cannot, therefore, approve significant changes. However, since there has always been a very good working relationship between Danida and the GTZ and also a joint approach to the support of VETA, I believe that we can also come to an understanding of the issues you raise. I also believe that these issues can be incorporated in Danida's support to an increased decentralisation of VETA.

I will be in Tanzania from 12 November and suggest that we present a joint proposal to VETA, the Danish embassy and GTZ, if you can wait for a decision until then.

I will pass on your letter to the officer within Danida responsible for Tanzania. **I also suggest that you send your letter to the Danish Embassy in Dar es Salaam (For the attention of Mr Rasmus Holm Lauridsen).** He will probably discuss the proposal with Ms Müller and prepare a memorandum on the issues.

I am not in office during the next week, since I am attending the conference on skills development in Interlaken and also the donor's informal coordinating meeting on skills development. However, I will be in office on Monday 17 September before I go on missions to South Africa, Eritrea and Malawi.

Yours sincerely,

Mogens Jensen